

DATE: March 9th, 2020

REPORT NO: PD-021-20

SUBJECT: Information Report
Update Relating to the Residential Lot Inventory for the
Smithville Settlement Area and Compliance Analysis with the
A Place to Grow (P2G) Plan.

CONTACT: Brian Treble, Director of Planning and Building

OVERVIEW:

- This report is written to inform the Planning/Building/Environmental Committee (the Committee) that Township Planning Staff continues to monitor the inventory of potential vacant residential lots inside the existing Smithville Settlement Area. Further, Staff is monitoring, as required, the number of housing starts per year, along with the breakdown of housing starts within the Built Boundary versus Greenfield lands in the Township of West Lincoln.
- Two issues arise as a result of this work: first, the number of available lots is too low at 11 greenfield and 113 infill for 2020 and second, that there is generally a good potential supply, but it needs to be brought on line quicker so that there is developable land available for 2021 and beyond. A potential of 917 lots are available to be brought on line.
- The housing starts are not up to the standard required in order to maintain/achieve our growth targets and the volume of housing starts is being hampered by the lack of supply.
- This report is written to inform the Committee of this information prior to submission of an annual report to the Region.

RECOMMENDATION

1. That, Report No. PD-021-20, dated March 9th, 2020, relating to the “Update of the Residential Lot Inventory for the Smithville Settlement Area and Compliance Analysis with the A Place to Grow (P2G) Plan”, BE RECEIVED FOR INFORMATION.

ALIGNMENT TO STRATEGIC PLAN

- Theme
 - Strategic Responsible Growth
 - Efficient, Fiscally Responsible Operations

BACKGROUND

In 2005, the Township of West Lincoln hired BLS Planning Consultants (Glen Barker) to commence a Growth Management Study of Smithville. This study was initiated to determine the amount of additional land, if any, that was required in order to accommodate continued residential growth. Part of this review was to establish an inventory of vacant lands and potential vacant lots within the existing Smithville Settlement Area. The first Table of this kind was created in 2007, and has been updated each year since that time.

Further, in 2006 the Province first passed the Places to Grow Act and the Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe Area (including Niagara Region). The Region of Niagara was instructed (along with all other Regions in the Greater Golden Horseshoe Area) to prepare an implementation strategy by 2008. The result was RPPA 2-2009.

Township Staff had concerns with the implementation strategy of RPPA 2-2009 and subsequently Township Council appealed the Regional Policy Plan to the former OMB, now known as the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal (LPAT). In conjunction with RPPA 2-2009, Township Official Plan Amendments (OPA) 37 and 38 accomplished an urban boundary adjustment known as “the swap”, for Smithville. Final approval of all of this process by the OMB occurred in 2015.

More recently, the Region was assigned provincial growth targets to achieve by 2041. The Township and Region are now working towards new growth targets for West Lincoln which will result in the monitoring of land supply being a continual, ongoing requirement.

The Province recently made changes to the Growth Plan which is now called A Place to Grow Plan. A new Land Needs calculation document and employment conversion needs guideline were also issued by the previous government and are currently under review by this Provincial Government. In order to implement all of the Provincial Policy by 2041 the Region is working on several policy documents as part of a new Regional Official Plan. At the same time, the Township is now working on a Master Community Plan and a Subwatershed Study for the future growth of Smithville and West Lincoln.

CURRENT SITUATION

Staff realize that the content of these monitoring tables is very important as we move forward. An evaluation of compliance with P2G, RPPA 2-2009, Niagara 2041 and current provincial policy is required in order to establish a strategy to implement P2G as it will relate to the future implementation of the new 2041 growth allocation numbers. The attached Tables provide a quick overview of our status with respect to available lands and our compliance with Regional and Provincial intensification targets. These two tables are discussed in more detail in the following sections of this report.

Vacant Lot Inventory

The first vacant lot inventory that was completed by Township staff in 2007 determined

that there were potentially up to 912 vacant lots inside the pre 2015 urban boundary of Smithville. Of these, 573 were potential Greenfield lots and 339 were potential lots located within the Built Boundary. Most of the Greenfield supply noted above, has now been consumed.

The Built Boundary is defined as the limit of continuous urban growth within the urban area, as it was determined by the Province, on June 6, 2006.

The most recent vacant lot inventory is found at Table 1 to this report, and now includes the Northwest Quadrant lands. Additional lots continue to be created and developed internal to the built boundary. This is in keeping with the concept of infill and intensification as required by provincial and regional policy. The information can be summarized as follows:

- Potential vacant residential lots within the Built Boundary of Smithville at the end of 2019 = 240 lots (of which only 127 currently are approved).
- Potential vacant residential lots within the Greenfield area of Smithville at the end of 2019= 815 lots (of which only 11 lots are approved).
- Total potential vacant residential lots in 2020= 1055 lots (only 138 are approved and available for building permits).

The 2011 Stats Canada numbers showed West Lincoln as the third fastest growing municipality in the Region (behind Grimsby and Niagara-on-the-Lake, and just ahead of Lincoln). Our 2011 population was established by Statistics Canada as 13,837 people with approximately 5,200 people in Smithville.

In 2017, the 2016 Statistics Canada numbers were released. These numbers showed that the population of the Township of West Lincoln was 14,500, with the population of Smithville estimated at 5,500. Some areas of our Township declined in population thereby slowing our overall growth to sixth place in the Region of Niagara.

Residential Infill and Intensification and New Housing Starts

Regional Policy Plan Amendment RPPA 2-2009 was first approved to implement the growth plan targets to 2031 and established that we were required to achieve an infill/intensification target of 15% by 2015. This meant that 15% of the total number of new housing starts in West Lincoln must be within the Built Boundary of Smithville (a line that was established by the Province on June 6, 2006). The province requires that the Region achieve 40% intensification across the Region. Each municipality has a different target, as assigned by the Region, based on the amount of developable land that is available; for example, Grimsby and St. Catharines are required to achieve 75% intensification in 2019. A new target will eventually be assigned by the Region for growth until 2041.

The Table found at Attachment No. 2 reflects our recent analysis of new housing starts

in the Township of West Lincoln and their relationship between Greenfield, Built Boundary, Rural and Hamlet Development.

Based on the building permit stats for 2019, we achieved 75% growth within the built boundary area in 2019; well above our 15% target. This is off balance because Greenfield lands are not at the final approval stages of the development approval process. By developing much of our infill lots now, it will make it harder to achieve this 15% target in the future. To achieve significant intensification in Smithville in the future will require redevelopment of some existing developed sites as well as developing all vacant lands. Until such time as redevelopment of existing sites is economical, our ability to intensify will be limited.

The new residential housing starts in the Township (specifically Smithville) need to grow over time in order to achieve our future growth targets. Unfortunately, the land available for development is currently in limited supply and therefore housing starts have been held back for the last 18 months or so.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Not applicable to this report.

INTER-DEPARTMENTAL COMMENTS

Not applicable to this report.

CONCLUSION

Additional changes are in the works since the Province recently announced a review of all population allocations. In addition, the employment land conversion requirements have recently changed and the land needs calculation methodology will be changing as well. The attached Tables have been submitted to Township Committee and Council for their information and review. The Region and the Province have requested annual updates of these tables and staff wish to ensure that they have been presented to Committee and Council first. These Tables will form a component of the discussions with the Region and Province as we work to achieve a growth strategy to implement the targets for 2041 and any future growth allocations.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Potential Residential Vacant Lot Inventory Table
2. Analysis of Residential Development (Building Permits Issued) in West Lincoln for Infill/Intensification

Prepared by:



Brian Treble, RPP, MCIP
Director of Planning and Building

B. Hendry

Beverly Hendry
CAO

X:\pb-Planning Reports\Working Copy\2020\3. March\PD--21- 2020 - Update Relating to Residential Lot Inventory\PD-021-20
Smithville Settlement Area to update vacant residential lot inventory.docx

: Unit Summary Update

MAP LABEL	SUBDIVISION	STATUS	FINAL CERTIFICATE ISSUED FOR ASSUMPTION (YEAR)	AREA (ha)	TOTAL APPRVD UNITS	NUMBER OF REMAINING VACANT UNITS				BUILT OUT (YEAR)	NOTES
						Singles	Semi's	Towns	Apts.		
A	Streamside	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2018 (final vacant lot and LC reduction 2019)	25	84	0	-	-	-	2019	
B	Brookside (Atwater)	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2019	3.3	44	-	0	0	-	2017	
C	Anastasio Phase 4 (Auburn Trail 2a & 2b)	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2019	9.4	136	0	-	-	-	2019	
D	Alma Acres Phase 3	Final Approved Plan		17.7	100	0	-	-	-	2012	
E	Station Meadows Phase 3	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2012	17.8	24	0	-	-	-	2014	
F	Spring Creek Estates	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2018	2.1	23	0	-	-	-	2016	
G-1	Brookside Phase 2 ***	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2016	3	48	0	0	0	-	2014	
G-2	Brookside Phase 3 ***	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2018	13.7	102	0	-	0	-	2014	
H	Spring Creek Heights	Secondary Plan As Amended By OPA 26 (18 units/ha) **		2.3	0	-	-	46 est	-		conversion analysis in progress
I	6334 Townline Road	No Application		1	0	2 est	-	-	-		
J	6392 Townline Road	No Application		0.6	0	6 est	-	-	-		
K	West Street (East of Streamside)	No Application		0.4	0	-	4 est	-	-		
L	Station Meadows Phase 4	Final Approved Plan	Final Certificate 2018	1.57	16	0	-	-	-	2016	
M	Streamside Commercial Block	Final Approved Plan		1.7	54	-	-	0	-		
N	Marz Homes (south of tracks)				0	57est	60est	100est	-		
O	Dunloe (north of tracks)	Draft Approval Granted Dec 16/19			123	29	20	74	0		
P	Budd (east of S. Grimsby Rd. 5)	Application Received in December 2019			395	68	0	327	-		
Q	East Smithville Secondary Plan	Under Review 2020			0	0	0	0	0		conversion analysis in progress
R	Spring Creek Manor	LPAT Approval 2019		0.5	11	0	2	9	0		
			TOTAL	99.57	1160	162 (p) 0 (a)	86 (p) 2 (a)	556 (p) 9 (a)	0		Total # of Vacant Units/Lots (Greenfield) 804 (p) 11 (a)
		** Potential number of vacant units determined by a factor of: L.D. 15 units/ ha, M.D. 20 units/ ha, H.D. 30 units /ha									0
MAP LABEL	INFILL LOTS (BUILT BOUNDARY)		Infill Factor	Area (ha)	Proposed # of Units	Number Potential Units And/Or Number of Units Available					
						Singles	Semi's	Towns	Apts's		
1	New Era (Condo) Rosemont	Site Plan & Plan of Condo Approved	as proposed	3.031	66	-	2	64	-		
2	Anastasio Phase 3	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	5.5	76	0	0	-	-	2018	
3	Shurie Road (Griffin Place)	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	0.9	40	-	0	0	-	2018	
4	Wes-Li Gardens	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	3.16	40	-	0	-	-	2015	
5	Wes-Li Heights	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	0.84	13	-	0	-	-	2016	
6	College Street	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	0.3	10	-	-	0	-	2009	
7	Smithville Station	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	6.18	98	13	-	25	-		
8	St. Catharine Street (NS)	Draft Approval Granted - 2018	M.D. - 20 units/ ha	0.6	20	-	-	2	-		
9	DiCarlo Property	Final Approved Plan - Developed	as approved	0.8	20	-	-	0	-	2012	
10	TWL Property Downtown		H.D. - 40 units/ ha	0.71	28	-	-	-	28 est		
11	6358 Townline Road	No Application	L.D. - 15 units / ha	0.6	5	0	-	-	-		
12	Crossings on the Twenty (South)	Final Approved Plan	as approved	0.7	24	-	-	20	-		
13	278 St. Catharine Street	No Application	L.D. - 18 units/ ha	0.4	7	-	7 est	-	-		
14	West Street (Starlight)	No Application	H.D. - 40 units/ ha	0.8	32	-	32 est	-	-		
15	314 St. Catharine Street	No Application	L.D. - 18 units/ ha	0.7	12	-	12 est	-	-		
16	Forest Avenue Property	Rezoning and Site Plan	H.D. - 40 units/ ha	0.4	32	-	-	-	32		
17	Crossings on the Twenty (North)	Draft Approval			10	-	-	-	-		
18	St. Martin's School Redevelopment	study not completed			HD	-	-	-	-		
19	College Street School Redevelopment	study not completed			HD	-	-	-	-		
20	Ellis Property - Station Street	Consent Approval 2019			4	4	0	0	0		
			TOTAL	25.62	537	0 (p) 17 (a)	53 (p) 2 (a)	0 (p) 109 (a)	60 (p)		Total # of Potential Units (Infill) 113 (p) 127 (a)
			GRAND TOTAL	125.19	1697	-	-	-	-		TOTAL SUPPLY 917 (p) 138 (a)

P = Potential A = Approved

Updated to December 31, 2019

**Analysis of Residential Development Units (Building Permits Issued) in West Lincoln
for Compliance with RPPA 2-2009 AND OFFICIAL PLAN AMENDMENT #38
to the Township of West Lincoln Official Plan**

Year	Greenfield Development in Smithville						Built Boundary Development in Smithville						Undelineated Hamlet (Greenfield)						Agricultural (Greenfield)					Analysis				
	Singles	Semi's	Triplex	Townhouses	Apartments in Dwellings	Other	Singles	Semis	Triplex	Townhouses	Apartments in Dwellings	Other	Singles	Semis	Triplex	Townhouses	Apartments in Dwellings	Other	Singles	Farm Help House	Garden Suites	Apartments in Houses	Other	Total Units in West Lincoln	Total Units in Smithville	Total Greenfield Units	Total Units Built Boundary	% in Built Boundary of Total
2003	0	0	0	0	0	0	68	34	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	22	0	0	0	0	130	102	0	102	78.46
2004	0	0	0	0	0	0	56	10	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	17	0	0	0	0	88	66	0	66	75.00
2005	0	0	0	0	0	0	70	20	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	22	0	0	0	0	116	90	0	90	77.59
2006	11	0	0	0	0	0	41	6	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	17	0	0	0	0	79	58	11	47	59.49
2007	32	6	6	8	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	15	0	0	0	0	0	21	1	0	0	0	95	58	52	6	6.32
2008	20	2	0	3	0	0	11	0	0	7	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	59	43	25	18	30.51
2009	11	2	3	4	2	0	7	10	0	3	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	52	42	22	20	38.46
2010	12	6	9	0	0	0	11	24	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	75	62	27	35	46.67
2011	24	0	18	4	0	0	3	10	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	77	59	46	13	16.88
2012	22	2	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	45	28	24	4	8.89
2013	25	2	30	0	0	0	4	0	0	10	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	81	71	57	14	17.28
2014	39	16	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	7	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	12	0	1	0	0	81	66	55	11	13.58
2015	52	2	0	46	0	0	4	0	0	0	0	3	1	0	0	0	0	0	14	0	0	0	0	122	107	100	7	5.74
2016	88	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	7	0	0	0	0	0	16	0	0	0	0	116	93	88	5	4.31
2017	0	0	0	8	0	0	1	28	12	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	11	1	0	0	1	65	49	8	41	63.07
2018	1	0	0	15	0	0	12	0	0	19	0	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	18	0	0	0	0	70	47	16	31	44.28
2019	0	0	0	8	0	0	4	0	0	45	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	65	57	8	49	75.38